



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE
KEITH FABER





65 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ContactUs@ohioauditor.gov
800-282-0370

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Village of Craig Beach
Mahoning County
2538 Grandview Road
Lake Milton, Ohio 44429

We have performed the procedures enumerated below on the Village of Craig Beach's (the Village) receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Village. The Village is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Village.

The Village Council, Mayor and the management of the Village have agreed to and acknowledged that the procedures performed are appropriate to meet the intended purpose of providing assistance in the evaluation of the Village's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances. No other party acknowledged the appropriateness of the procedures. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of the report and may not meet the needs of all users of the report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in the report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

For the purposes of performing these procedures, this report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

Cash

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2024 and December 31, 2023 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2023 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Cash Summary by Fund Report to the December 31, 2022 balances in the prior year audited statements. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2024 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Cash Summary by Fund to the December 31, 2023 balances in the Cash Summary by Fund. We found no exceptions.

3. We agreed the 2024 and 2023 bank reconciliation as of December 31, 2024 and 2023 to the total fund cash balances reported in the Cash Summary Report and the financial statements filed by the Village in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.
4. We observed the year-end bank balances on the financial institution's website. The balances agreed. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2024 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected all reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2024 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January and February bank statements. 1 of three checks was voided in 2025. We found no exceptions.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register and determined the debits were dated prior to December 31. We found no exceptions.

Property Taxes, Intergovernmental and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts

1. We selected a total of 5 receipts from the *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes*, State Distribution Transaction Listing (DTL), and the County Auditor Vendor History Report for 2024 and a total of 5 from 2023:
 - a. We compared the amount from the above-named reports to the amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine these receipts were allocated to the proper funds as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.05 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether it included 2 real estate tax receipts plus 13 advances for 2024 and 11 advances for 2023. The Receipt Register Report included the proper number of tax receipts for each year. We found no exceptions.
3. We confirmed \$102,562.86 from the Ohio Public Works Commission to the Village during 2023 with the Ohio Public Works Commission. We found the Village did not book into the financial accounting system a total of \$101,756 disbursed on their behalf from the Ohio Public Works Commission. It should have been allocated to the Street Levy Fund (Fund 2902) in the amount of \$67,369 and the Street Construction maintenance & Repair Fund (Fund 2011) in the amount of \$34,387 for a total of \$101,756. The balances in each of these respective funds did not change as a result of not posting them into the financial accounting system as the receipt and disbursement offset each other, so no fund balance adjustment was needed.
 - a. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether these receipts were allocated to the proper funds. We found these monies provided by the Ohio Public Works Commission were not posted to the financial accounting system of the Village during 2023.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipts were recorded in the proper year. We found these monies provided by the Ohio Public Works Commission were not posted to the financial accounting system of the Village during 2023.

Other Receipts

We selected 10 other receipts from the year ended December 31, 2023 and:

- a. Agreed the receipt amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report to supporting documentation. The amounts agreed.
- b. Confirmed the amounts charged complied with rates in force during the period. We found no exceptions.
- c. Inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine the receipt was posted to the proper funds and was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Debt

1. The prior audit report disclosed no debt outstanding as of December 31, 2022.
2. We inquired of management and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2024 or 2023 or debt payment activity during 2024 or 2023. There were no new debt issuances, nor any debt payment activity during 2024 or 2023.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2024 and 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2023 from the Wage Withholdings Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard and legislatively approved rate or salary). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was allowable based on the employees' duties as documented in the employees' personnel files and/or minute record. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected 3 new employees and Council Members from 2024 and 3 new employees and Council Members from 2023 and:
 - a. We inspected the employees'/Council Members' personnel files for the Retirement system, Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization.
 - b. We agreed the items in a above to the Personnel Files.

We found no exceptions.
3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2024 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period during 2024. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2025	January 3, 2025	\$445.30	\$445.30
State income taxes	January 15, 2025	January 7, 2025	\$270.01	\$270.01
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2025	January 3, 2025	\$1,449.26	\$1,449.26

We found no exceptions.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2024 and 10 from the year ended 2023 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check and ACH on bank agreed to the check/ACH number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.
 - d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D). We found 2 instances where disbursements requiring certification were not certified of which both instances were where the certification date was after the vendor invoice date, and there was also no evidence that a *Then and Now Certificate* was issued. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D) requires certifying at the time of a commitment, which should be on or before the invoice date, unless a *Then and Now Certificate* is used. Because we did not inspect all disbursements requiring certification, our report provides no assurance whether or not additional similar errors occurred.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus contract commitments including outstanding encumbrances) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations (Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.38 and 5705.40) plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 for the General, Street Construction and Maintenance Fund, Fire Levy Fund, Police Levy Fund, and Fire Apparatus & Equipment Levy as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. Expenditures did not exceed appropriations.
2. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 for negative cash fund balance. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.10(l) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. There were no funds having negative cash fund balances.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Village's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(2) and 149.43(B)(7)(c) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected all public records requests from the engagement period and inspected each request to determine the following:
 - a. The Village was compliant and responded to the request in accordance with their adopted policy as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). We found no exceptions.

Date Request Received	Date Request Fulfilled	Policy Response Time (in Business days)	Actual Response Time (in Business days)
5/16/2024	5/16/2024	3	1
12/10/2024	12/10/2024	3	1
12/10/2024	12/12/2024	3	2

- b. The Village did not have any denied public records requests during the engagement period.
 - c. The Village did not have any public records requests with redactions during the engagement period.
3. We inquired whether the Village had a records retention schedule and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
4. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
5. We inquired with Village management and determined that the Village did not have a policy manual during the engagement period therefore the public records policy could not be included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2).
6. We observed that the Village's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Village as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
7. We inquired with Village management and determined that the Village did not have any applications for record disposal submitted to the Records Commission during the engagement period.
8. We inspected individual proof of attendance and determined whether each elected official in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(1) (or their designee) successfully attended a certified three-hour Public Records Training for each term of office as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 109.43(B). We found no exceptions.
9. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Village notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
10. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.
We found no exceptions.
11. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.
We found no exceptions.

Contract Compliance:

1. We inspected the Minutes and Payment Register Report and identified the Village had expenditures subject to competitive bidding. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected 1 contract subject to competitive bidding requirements for 2023 and:
 - a. We inspected the contract and other bids for the contracted expenditure and determined:
 - i. The Village accepted the lowest bid and met the requirements of Ohio Rev. Code § 735.05
 - ii. No bid splitting occurred.
 - iii. No deliberate attempts to evade bid limitations occurred, such as successive contracts just under the bid amount, occurred.
 - iv. No apparent interest in the contract by a public official occurred.
We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the advertisements of the proposals for bids in the newspaper, and determined they were made as required by Ohio Rev. Code §731.14 We found no exceptions.
3. We inspect the modified contract documents for the contracts in procedure 1 and determined it contained:
 - a. Signatures of the contractor
 - b. Signatures of the appropriate officials including the contractor, engineer and mayor.
We found no exceptions.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 117.38 requires villages to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies, regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Village filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 in the Hinkle system. We found no exceptions.
2. We inquired of the fiscal officer and inspected the Fiscal Integrity Act Portal (<http://www.ohioauditor.gov/fiscalintegrity/default.html>) to determine whether the fiscal officer obtained the training required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 507.12 and 733.81. Fiscal Officer obtained the required training.

We were engaged by the Village to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with the attestation standards established by the AICPA and the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Village's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the Village and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the ethical requirements established by the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards* related to our agreed upon procedures engagement.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Keith Faber". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Keith" and last name "Faber" clearly distinguishable.

Keith Faber
Auditor of State
Columbus, Ohio

May 22, 2025

This page intentionally left blank.

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



VILLAGE OF CRAIG BEACH

MAHONING COUNTY

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 6/10/2025

65 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov