



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE  
**KEITH FABER**





# OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



Lausche Building, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
615 Superior Avenue, NW  
Cleveland, Ohio 44113-1801  
(216) 787-3665 or (800) 626-2297  
NortheastRegion@ohioauditor.gov

## INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANTS' REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Plymouth Township  
Ashtabula County  
4350 Runkle Avenue  
Ashtabula, Ohio 44004

We have performed the procedures enumerated below, which were agreed to by the Board of Trustees and the management of Plymouth Township (the Township) on the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the Townships cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Township. The Township is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Township. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

This report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

### Cash

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2018 and December 31, 2017 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2017 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2016 balances in the prior year audited statements. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2018 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2017 balances in the Cash Summary by Fund Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We agreed the totals per the bank reconciliations to the total of the December 31, 2018 and 2017 fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report. The amounts agreed.
4. We confirmed the December 31, 2018 bank account balances with the Township's financial institution. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2018 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected a sample (agreed upon) of five reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2018 bank reconciliation:
  - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January bank statement. We found no exceptions.
  - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, to determine the debits were dated prior to December 31. There were no exceptions.

**Property Taxes, Intergovernmental and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts**

1. We selected a property tax receipt from one *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes* (the Statement) for 2018 and one from 2017:
  - a. We traced the gross receipts from the *Statement* to the amount recorded in the Revenue Ledger. The amounts agreed.
  - b. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to confirm the receipt was allocated to the proper funds as required by Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.05-.06 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
  - c. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to confirm whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year.
  
2. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to determine whether it included two real estate tax receipts for 2018 and 2017. The Revenue Ledger included the proper number of tax receipts for each year.
  
3. We selected a sample (agreed upon) of five receipts from the State Distribution Transaction Lists (DTL) from 2018 and five from 2017. We also selected a sample (agreed upon) of five receipts from the County Auditor's DTLs from 2018 and five from 2017.
  - a. We compared the amount from the above reports to the amount recorded in the Revenue Ledger. The amounts agreed.
  - b. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to determine that these receipts were allocated to the proper fund(s). We found one exception. The 2017 manufactured homes homestead and rollback tax receipt of \$27.14 was posted to the General Fund but should have been distributed as follows: General \$6.20, Road & Bridge \$12.58, and Fire \$8.36. The Fiscal Officer posted the correction to their accounting records. However, because we did not inspect all Intergovernmental receipts, our report provides no assurance regarding whether or not other similar errors occurred.
  - c. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to determine whether the receipts were recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
  
4. We confirmed an Ohio Public Works Commission payment of \$185,000 on-behalf of the Township was paid directly to a Koski Construction Co. for paving for the Garrison Road East. The payment was not recorded in the Township's accounting system receipt ledger or as a corresponding disbursement. We recommend the Township record the revenue and corresponding disbursement for grants awarded when the grantor makes payment(s) directly to the vendor on-behalf of the Township in accordance with AOS Bulletins 2000-008 and 2002-004.

**Debt**

1. From the prior audit documentation, we observed the following note was outstanding as of December 31, 2016. These amounts agreed to the Township's January 1, 2017 balances on the summary we used in procedure 3.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2016:
Garage Loan	\$168,000
Ambulance Loan	\$31,500

**Debt (Continued)**

2. We inquired of management, and inspected the Revenue Ledger and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2018 or 2017 or debt payment activity during 2018 or 2017. All debt agreed to the summary we used in procedure 3. There were no new debt issuances during 2018 or 2017.
3. We obtained a summary of loans debt activity for 2018 and 2017 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedules to debt service fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Township made the payments. We found no exceptions.

**Payroll Cash Disbursements**

1. We selected one payroll check for five employees from 2018 and one payroll check for five employees from 2017 from the Employee Wage Base Detail Report and:
  - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Employee Wage Base Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard, legislatively or statutorily-approved rate or salary. We found no exceptions.
  - b. We inspected the fund and account code(s) to which the check was posted to determine the posting was reasonable based on the employees' duties as documented in the minute record or as required by statute. We also confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. For any new employees selected in procedure 1 we inspected the employees' personnel files for the following information and compared it with the information used to compute gross and net pay related to this check:
  - a. Name
  - b. Authorized salary or pay rate
  - c. Department(s) and fund(s) to which the check should be charged
  - d. Retirement system participation and payroll withholding
  - e. Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization and withholding
  - f. Any other deduction authorizations (deferred compensation, etc.)

We found no exceptions related to procedures a. – f. above.

3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2018 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2018. We observed the following:

<b>Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)</b>	<b>Date Due</b>	<b>Date Paid</b>	<b>Amount Due</b>	<b>Amount Paid</b>
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2019	December 31, 2018	\$2,686.44	\$2,686.44
State income taxes	January 31, 2019	December 31, 2018	\$800.62	\$800.62
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2019	December 31, 2018	\$2,788.65	\$2,788.65

### **Payroll Cash Disbursements (Continued)**

4. We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 to determine if township employees and/or trustees were reimbursed for out-of-pocket insurance premiums. Insurance reimbursements made were in compliance with ORC 505.60 and 505.601 and federal regulations.

### **Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements**

1. We selected a sample (agreed upon) of 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2018 and 10 from the year ended 2017 and determined whether:
  - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
  - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
  - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.
  - d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(D). We found no exceptions.

### **Compliance – Budgetary**

1. We compared the total estimated receipts from the Amended Official Certificate of Estimated Resources, required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.36(A)(1), to the amounts recorded in the Revenue Status Report for the General, Road & Bridge and Fire Funds for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017. The amounts on the Certificate agreed to the amount recorded in the accounting system, except for the General and Fire Funds. The Revenue Status Report recorded budgeted (i.e. certified) resources for the General and Fire Funds of \$127,907 and \$139,000, respectively, for 2017. However, the final *Amended Official Certificate of Estimated Resources* reflected \$120,648 and \$140,698, respectively. The fiscal officer should periodically compare amounts recorded in the Revenue Status Report to amounts recorded on the *Amended Official Certificate of Estimated Resources* to assure they agree. If the amounts do not agree, the Trustees may be using inaccurate information for budgeting and monitoring purposes.
2. We inspected the appropriation measures adopted for 2018 and 2017 to determine whether, for the General, Road & Bridge and Fire Funds, the Trustees appropriated separately for "each office, department, and division, and within each, the amount appropriated for personal services," as is required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.38(C). We found no exceptions.
3. We compared total appropriations required by Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.38 and 5705.40, to the amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report for 2018 and 2017 for the following funds: General, Road & Bridge, and Fire. The amounts on the appropriation resolutions agreed to the amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report.
4. Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.36(A)(5) and 5705.39 prohibits appropriations from exceeding the certified resources. We compared total appropriations to total certified resources for the General, Road & Bridge and Fire Funds for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017. There were no funds for which appropriations exceeded certified resources.

### **Compliance – Budgetary (Continued)**

5. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 for the General, Road & Bridge and Fire Funds, as recorded in the Budgetary Comparison Spreadsheets. There were no funds for which expenditures exceeded appropriations.
6. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.09 requires establishing separate funds to segregate externally-restricted resources. We inspected the Revenue Ledger for evidence of new restricted receipts requiring a new fund during December 31, 2018 and 2017. We also inquired of management regarding whether the Township received new restricted receipts. We observed no evidence of new restricted receipts for which Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.09 would require the Township to establish a new fund.
7. For funds existing in prior years, we inspected the fund activity to determine whether the fund is still being used for the statutorily approved purpose and that all the required funds were established. All the required funds were established and no funds for which the statutorily approved purpose was no longer valid were included on the accounting records.
8. We inspected the 2018 and 2017 Revenue Status Reports and Appropriation Status Reports for evidence of interfund transfers exceeding \$2,500 which Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.14 - .16 restrict. The Township transferred \$2,900 from the Capital Projects Fund to the Road & Bridge Fund. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.16 does not permit this transfer without approval of the Tax Commissioner (effective after June 30, 2017) or the Court of Common Pleas (effective through June 30, 2017). The Township did not obtain this approval. We therefore requested management to adjust this amount to the Capital Projects Fund. We noted the fiscal officer adjusted this amount on June 10, 2019.
9. We inquired of management and inspected the Appropriation Status Reports to determine whether the Township elected to establish reserve accounts permitted by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.13. The Township did not establish these reserves.
10. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 for negative cash fund balances. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.10 (I) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. No funds had a negative cash fund balances.

### **Compliance – Contracts & Expenditures**

1. We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 to determine if the township proceeded by force account (i.e. used its own employees) to maintain or repair roads (cost of project \$15,000-\$45,000) or to construct or reconstruct township roads (cost of project \$5,000-\$15,000/per mile) for which Ohio Rev. Code Section 5575.01 requires the county engineer to complete a force account project assessment form (i.e., cost estimate). Time cards documented \$39,984 of salaries and benefits related to repaving 5,160 feet of Garrison Road East. The Township also spent \$121,963 in materials and \$27,900 of rented equipment for this project. This total exceeds the \$45,000 limit Ohio Rev. Code Section 5575.01 permits for Townships to spend on road construction projects using its own labor force, equipment and supplies. The Township also failed to obtain the force account project assessment form (i.e., cost estimate) from the county engineer, as is also required

### Compliance – Contracts & Expenditures (Continued)

by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5575.01. Because this is the first instance of noncompliance the Auditor of State has reported for these force account requirements, the Township's force account limits are hereby reduced to \$15,000 for maintenance and repair of a road and \$5,000 per mile for construction or reconstruction of a township road for one year commencing from the date we notified the Township of this violation.

### Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code Section 117.38 requires townships to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Township filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy, within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017 in the Hinkle system. There were no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Fiscal Integrity Act Portal (<http://www.ohioauditor.gov/fiscalintegrity/default.html>) to determine whether the fiscal officer obtained the training required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 507.12 and 733.81. Fiscal Officer obtained the required training.
3. Ohio Rev. Code § 109.60(A)(1) requires Law Enforcement of Townships to report specific information to the Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigation (BCI) for certain offenses. Township Law Enforcement shall immediately upon arrest of any person (or taking into custody for any child under 18) take and forward the person's or child's fingerprints. We inspected the NICS Process form to determine if there is an established method of fingerprint submission to BCI. Per inquiry of the fiscal officer and review of the NICS spreadsheet, it was noted that these requirements do not apply to Plymouth Township.
4. For all credit card accounts we obtained:
  - copies of existing internal control policies,
  - a list(s) of authorized users, and
  - a list of all credit card account transactions.
  - a. We inspected the established policy(ies) obtained above and determined it is:
    - i. in compliance with the HB 312 statutory requirements, and
    - ii. Implemented by the entity.  
We found no exceptions.
  - b. We selected 3 credit card transactions for testing. For selected transactions we inspected documentation to determine that:
    - i. Use was by an authorized user within the guidelines established in the policy, and
    - ii. Each transaction was supported with original invoices and for a proper public purpose.

We found a Fire Department disbursement in the amount of \$26 was charged to the Cemetery Fund instead of the Fire & E.M.S. Fund.



This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants attestation standards and applicable attestation engagement standards included in the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Township's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you

This report is to provide assistance in the evaluation of the Township's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2018 and 2017, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances and is not suitable for any other purpose.



Keith Faber  
Auditor of State  
Columbus, Ohio

June 19, 2019

**This page intentionally left blank.**

# OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



**PLYMOUTH TOWNSHIP**

**ASHTABULA COUNTY**

### **CLERK'S CERTIFICATION**

**This is a true and correct copy of the report which is required to be filed in the Office of the Auditor of State pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in Columbus, Ohio.**

*Susan Babbitt*

**CLERK OF THE BUREAU**

**CERTIFIED  
JULY 9, 2019**